

Savanna Ecosystem Restoration Environmental Assessment

Lead Agency: USDA Forest Service
Huron-Manistee National Forests

Responsible Official: Leslie E. Russell
District Ranger
Huron-Manistee National Forests
Baldwin-White Cloud Ranger District

**For Further Information
Contact:** Christopher J. Frederick
Interdisciplinary Team Leader
Huron-Manistee National Forests
Baldwin-White Cloud Ranger District
P.O. Box Drawer D
650 N. Michigan Avenue
Baldwin, MI, 49304
Phone: (231) 745-4631, ext 3138
E-mail: cfrederick@fs.fed.us

The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) prohibits discrimination in all its programs and activities on the basis of race, color, national origin, age, disability, and where applicable, sex, marital status, familial status, parental status, religion, sexual orientation, genetic information, political beliefs, reprisal, or because all or part of an individual's income is derived from any public assistance program. (Not all prohibited bases apply to all programs.) Persons with disabilities who require alternative means for communication of program information (Braille, large print, audiotape, etc.) should contact USDA's TARGET Center at 202-720-2600 (voice and TDD). To file a complaint of discrimination, write to USDA, Director, Office of Civil Rights, 1400 Independence Avenue, S.W., Washington, DC 20250-9410 or call (800)795-3272 (voice) or (202) 720-6382 (TDD). USDA is an equal opportunity provider and employer.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Purpose and Need

Project Area Location	1-1
Introduction	1-1
Forest Plan Direction	1-4
Purpose and Need for the Proposal	1-7
Proposed Actions that Address the Need for Proposal	1-10
Scoping and Public Involvement	1-12
Issues	1-12
Resource Areas of Analysis	1-13
Decision to be Made	1-13
Availability of the Planning Record	1-14

Chapter 2: Summary of Alternatives

Introduction	2-1
Developing a Range of Alternatives	2-1
Alternatives Considered in Detail	2-2
Visual Representation	2-5
Conservation Measures	2-6
Monitoring	2-6
Alternatives Considered but Eliminated from Detailed Study	2-8

Chapter 3: Existing Conditions, Affected Environment, and Environmental Effects

Introduction	3-1
Biological Resources	
Woody Vegetation	
Existing Condition and Resource Specific Information	3-1
Area of Analysis	3-5
Direct and Indirect Effects	3-5
Cumulative Effects	3-14
Herbaceous Vegetation	
Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-18
Area of Analysis	3-29
Direct and Indirect Effects	3-30
Cumulative Effects	3-38
Wildlife	
Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-41
Area of Analysis	3-51
Effects on Federally-Listed Endangered and Threatened Wildlife Species	3-51
Karner Blue Butterfly	3-51

Chapter 3 (continued)

	Direct and Indirect Effects	3-55
	Cumulative Effects	3-68
Indiana Bat		3-69
	Direct Effects	3-71
	Indirect Effects	3-72
	Cumulative Effects	3-76
Effects on Regional Forester's Sensitive Species and Other Wildlife		3-77
	Wildlife Associated with Early Successional Vegetative Types	3-77
	Direct and Indirect Effects	3-77
	Cumulative Effects	3-85
	Wildlife Associated with Mid- to Late-Successional Forest Types	3-86
	Direct and Indirect Effects	3-86
	Cumulative Effects	3-93
	Wildlife Associated with Streams, Creeks, Lakes, and Wetlands	3-95
	Direct and Indirect Effects	3-95
	Cumulative Effects	3-99
	Determination of Effects for Endangered, Threatened, and Sensitive Wildlife Species	3-101
Fisheries and Watershed		
	Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-104
	Area of Analysis	3-106
	Direct and Indirect Effects of Alternative 1	3-107
	Cumulative Effects of Alternative 1	3-107
	Direct and Indirect Effects of Alternatives 2 and 3	3-108
	Cumulative Effects of Alternatives 2 and 3	3-110
Physical Resources		
Air		
	Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-111
	Area of Analysis	3-114
	Direct and Indirect Effects	3-114
	Cumulative Effects	3-116
Fuels		
	Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-118
	Areas of Analysis	3-121
	Direct and Indirect Effects	3-121
	Cumulative Effects	3-122
Soils		
	Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-123
	Area of Analysis	3-132
	Direct and Indirect Effects	3-132
	Cumulative Effects	3-145

Chapter 3 (continued)

Social Resources

Recreation

Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-148
Area of Analysis	3-158
Alternative 1	
Direct and Indirect Effects	3-158
Cumulative Effects	3-159
Alternative 2	
Direct and Indirect Effects	3-159
Cumulative Effects	3-167
Alternative 3	
Direct and Indirect Effects	3-168
Cumulative Effects	3-171

Scenery Management

Resource-Specific Information	3-172
Existing Condition	3-174
Area of Analysis	3-175
Direct and Indirect Effects	3-175
Cumulative Effects	3-180

Transportation

Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-182
Area of Analysis	3-191
Direct and Indirect Effects	3-191
Cumulative Effects	3-202

Economics

Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-204
Area of Analysis	3-204
Direct and Indirect Effects	3-204
Cumulative Effects	3-209

Heritage Resources

Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-213
Direct, Indirect, and Cumulative Effects	3-215

Environmental Justice

Existing Condition and Resource-Specific Information	3-216
Area of Analysis	3-217
Effects Common to All Alternatives	3-217

Irreversible and Irretrievable Commitment of Resources

Area of Analysis	3-218
Effects Common to All Alternatives	3-218

Chapter 4: Lists

Preparers/Contributors	4-1
Agencies, Organizations, and Persons to Whom Scoping Letters Were Sent	4-2
Literature Cited	4-8

Appendix A	
Conservation Measures	A-1
Appendix B	
Scoping Responses Received during the 30-Day Comment Period	B-1
Appendix C	
Herbicide Use	C-1
History of Limitations on the HMNF	C-1
Registration	C-1
Toxicity	C-2
Glyphosate	C-3
Triclopyr	C-5
Imazapyr	C-8
Factors of Effectiveness	C-9
Additives	C-10
Methods of Application	C-10
Timing of Application	C-11
Figures	
Figure 1.1: The Otto and White River Metapopulations within the Muskegon Recovery Unit	1-3
Figure 3.1: Acres of Forest Type on National Forest System Lands within the Project Area	3-3
Figure 3.2: Alternative 1: Projected Acres of Forest Type, 2019	3-7
Figure 3.3: Alternatives 2 and 3: Projected Acres of Forest Type, 2019	3-9
Figure 3.4: Changes in monitored Karner blue butterfly sites designated as 'present' and 'absent' between 1997 and 2009 within the Manistee National Forest	3-55
Figure 3.5: Distribution of Indiana bat in Michigan.	3-71
Figure 3.6: Map of the wetland areas that are present in the Project Area.	3-109
Maps	
Project Vicinity Map	1-16
Alternative Maps	2-13
Map 3.1: Soil Productivity Sites of Concern – Compartment 418	3-126
Map 3.2: Soil Productivity Sites of Concern – Compartment 421	3-128
Map 3.3: Soil Productivity Sites of Concern – Compartment 422	3-128
Map 3.4: Soil Productivity Sites of Concern – Compartment 439	3-129
Map 3.5: Soil Productivity Sites of Concern – Compartment 458	3-129
Map 3.6: WRSNA Existing Condition	3-151
Map 3.7: WRSNA Existing User-Created Dispersed Campsites	3-152
Map 3.8: Existing Recreation Sites within the Project Area	3-154
Map 3.9: West Shore Snowmobile Trail within the Project Area	3-155
Map 3.10: Existing Condition of User-Created Dispersed Campsites in Otto	3-157

Maps (continued)

Map 3.11: Recreation Elements in the WRSNA under Alternative 2	3-162
Map 3.12: Proposed Campsites in the WRSNA under Alternative 2	3-165
Map 3.13: Recreation Elements in the WRSNA under Alternative 3	3-170
Map 3.14 Management Areas within the Project Area	3-187

Tables

Table 2.1: Summary Comparison of Alternatives	2-10
Table 3.1: Acres of Forest Types by Age Class, 2009	3-2
Table 3.2: Table 3.2: Desired, Existing, & Project Area Vegetative Composition Objectives	3-4
Table 3.3: Alternative 1: Projected Acres of Forest Types by Age Class, 2019	3-6
Table 3.4: Alternatives 2 and 3: Projected Acres of Forest Types by Age Class, 2019	3-8
Table 3.5: Project Area Vegetation Treatments 1978 - 2010	3-14
Table 3.6: Alternative 1: Change in Vegetative Class Composition	3-16
Table 3.7: Alternatives 2 and 3: Change in Vegetative Type Composition from 2009	3-18
Table 3.8: Management Strategies for the Seeding of Nectar Plants	3-20
Table 3.9: NNIS Control Recommendations	3-21
Table 3.10: Herbicide Recommendations for Non-Native and Undesired Plant Species Hindering Establishment of Karner Blue Butterfly Nectar Plant Species	3-24
Table 3.11: Regional Forester Sensitive Species Identified in the Project Area	3-26
Table 3.12: Habitat Determinations within the Project Area for Regional Forester Sensitive Species	3-26
Table 3.13: Determination Table by Habitat Type for Regional Forester Sensitive Plant Species	3-38
Table 3.14: Determination Table for Regional Forester Sensitive Plants Found in the Project Area	3-38
Table 3.15: Habitat Ecology and Distribution for Wildlife Species included in this Environmental Assessment	3-44
Table 3.16: Michigan Natural Features Inventory Results for Regional Forester's Sensitive Wildlife Species within the Savanna Ecosystem Restoration Project Area	3-48
Table 3.17: Huron-Manistee National Forests Endangered, Threatened, and Sensitive Species Database Results for Wildlife within the Savanna Ecosystem Restoration Project Area	3-49
Table 3.18: U.S. Forest Service Survey Results for Wildlife within the Savanna Restoration Project Area	3-49
Table 3.19: Determination of Effects for Endangered, Threatened, and Sensitive Wildlife Species that Might Occur within the Savanna Ecosystem Restoration Project Area	3-101
Table 3.20: Early Successional Forest Cover (open area) in the Four 6 th Code HUCs of the Project Area, including Percent Open Area.	3-104

Tables (continued)

Table 3.21: Existing Miles and Densities of Roads and Trails (by 6 th Code HUC).	3-105
Table 3.22: Electro-fishing Results of Lower Carlton Creek, August 18-20, 1986.	3-106
Table 3.23: Aquatic Management Indicator Species	3-107
Table 3.24: Watershed Areas and Acres of Open Habitat (Stratified by 6 th code HUCs)	3-108
Table 3.25: Emissions by Category Report – PM _{2.5} – Tons/Year	3-112
Table 3.26: Estimated GHG Emissions from a 500 acre Prescribed Burn	3-116
Table 3.27: Primary Greenhouse Gas Emissions from Prescribed Burning	3-116
Table 3.28: Acreage and Percentage of Jack Pine and Red Pine-Dominated Stands On National Forest System Lands within the Project Area	3-119
Table 3.29: Fuel Models of Project Area	3-119
Table 3.30: Fuel Loading Subsets	3-120
Table 3.31: Landtype Characteristics for All Ownerships within the Project Area	3-123
Table 3.32: Land Suitability Classes within the Project Area	3-132
Table 3.33: Approximate Total Acres of Soils Impacted by the Transportation System on National Forest System Lands within the Project Area	3-138
Table 3.34: Approximate Acreage of Soils Impacted by Recreation within the Project Area	3-141
Table 3.35: Herbicide Mobility and Persistence in the Soil	3-144
Table 3.36: Existing Numbers and Types of Campsites in the Project Area	3-153
Table 3.37: Existing Scenic Classes	3-175
Table 3.38: Alternative 1: Interim Scenic Class and Scenic Integrity	3-176
Table 3.39: Alternatives 2 and 3: Interim Scenic Class and Scenic Integrity	3-178
Table 3.40: Project Area Road Data	3-185
Table 3.41: Alternatives 2 and 3 Road System Proposals in the White River Portion of the Project Area	3-195
Table 3.42: Alternatives 2 and 3 Road System Proposals within the Otto Portion of the Project Area	3-200
Table 3.43: Proximity of HMNF Lands to Existing Roads	3-203
Table 3.44: Estimated Revenues and Costs for Harvest Activities	3-206
Table 3.45: Non-timber Related Costs for the Savanna Ecosystem Restoration Project	3-209
Table 3.46: Demographic Trends within the Area of Analysis	3-217
Table C.1: Toxicity Categories and Hazard Indicators of Pesticides	C-2
Table C.2: Mammalian (Human) Toxicity Categories for the Herbicides Being Considered for Use	C-3
Table C.3: Characteristics of Glyphosate	C-5
Table C.4: Characteristics of Triclopyr	C-7
Table C.5: Characteristics of Imazapyr	C-9

Organization of the Savanna Ecosystem Restoration Project Environmental Assessment

Chapter 1 introduces the Purpose and Need for the activities that the Forest Service is proposing, the relevant issues surrounding the project, and other issues and management concerns.

Chapter 2 presents and compares the activities that would be implemented under each alternative, the activities that would be monitored to document the effectiveness of the treatments with applicable mitigation measures, and the resource-specific existing condition within the Savanna Ecosystem Restoration Project Area (Project Area).

Chapter 3 describes the existing condition by resource area and the biological, social, and economic effects associated with the proposed actions under each alternative. This includes the direct, indirect, and cumulative effects likely to occur with implementation.

Chapter 4 identifies those involved in the preparation of the document, mailing lists, and literature cited.

Appendix A provides a detailed description of the measures that would be implemented to ensure protection of the resources within the Project Area

Appendix B provides a summary of the comments that were received during scoping and where the substantive comments are addressed in the document.

Appendix C provides a summary of information relating to the application of herbicides and the characteristics of the specific herbicides proposed for use.

Further information related to this project is included in the Planning Record located at the Baldwin-White Cloud District office.